# A brief introduction to deliberative processes

Florence Morestin (NCCHPP)

CPHA Conference

Edmonton, June 13, 2012



Centre de collaboration nationale sur les politiques publiques et la santé

National Collaborating Centre for Healthy Public Policy Institut national de santé publique Québec 🎄 🕸

## Evidence-based vs. evidence-informed (Keeling, 2011)

- Similar underlying goals: Find and use the best available evidence when planning and implementing interventions
- Difference:
  - EBDM: Scientific evidence is the basis for decision making
  - EIDM: Diverse factors play a role in decision making, often in competition with scientific evidence

## Of evidence and deliberative processes

Lomas et al., 2005:

- "Evidence is inherently uncertain, dynamic, complex, contestable, and rarely complete" (p. 9)
- Needs to be interpreted and supplemented by "colloquial" evidence drawn from local experience
- Deliberative processes are a way of combining various forms of evidence in a transparent and explicit manner



Lomas, J., Culyer, A. J., McCutcheon, C., McAuley, L., & Law, S. (2005). *Conceptualizing and Combining Evidence for Health System Guidance*. Ottawa: Canadian Health Services Research Foundation. Retrieved from: http://www.chsrf.ca/other\_documents/pdf/evidence\_e.pdf

# A definition (Gauvin, 2009)

#### **Deliberative process:**

Process allowing a **group** of actors to receive and exchange **information** and **critically examine** an issue in order to **inform decision-making** 

Gauvin, F.P. (2009). *What is a deliberative process? Fact sheet*. Montreal: National Collaborating Centre for Healthy Public Policy. Retrieved from: <u>http://www.ncchpp.ca/130/Publications.ccnpps?id\_article=283</u>

# Two major approaches (Gauvin, 2009)

#### **1. Application of research-based knowledge**

- Building bridges between experts and decisionmakers
- Co-production and co-interpretation of research

#### 2. Democratic governance

- Emphasis on the participation of civil society
- The public's perspective is taken into account
- Enhances transparency and legitimacy of decision making

#### Deliberative processes vary:

#### 1. What is the goal?

Make a decision

Formulate recommendations

Formulate value statements

Identify or clarify issues



#### Deliberative processes vary:

#### 2. When to initiate?

Can be at various stages in decision-making process / in research project

#### 3. Who participates?

E.g.: Experts, decision-makers, community groups, citizens, other stakeholders...

# 4. What is the degree of control of participants over the decision-making process?

From simple consultation, to control of the decision-making process

#### Further resources

- Series of fact sheets produced by the NCCHPP (F.P. Gauvin) <u>http://www.ncchpp.ca/130/publications.ccnpps</u>
- Lavis, J. N., Boyko, J. A., Oxman, A. D., Lewin, S., & Fretheim, A. (2009).
  SUPPORT Tools for evidence-informed health Policymaking (STP) 14: Organising and using policy dialogues to support evidence-informed policymaking. *Health Research Policy and Systems*, 7(Suppl 1)(S14)
- Hastings Center Report Vol. 42, No. 2 March-April 2012: Essays about public deliberation

